

North Yorkshire Council

Scarborough and Whitby Area Constituency Planning Committee

Minutes of the meeting held on Thursday, 10th August, 2023 commencing at 14:00.

Councillors in attendance: Councillor Phil Trumper in the Chair, plus Councillors Janet Jefferson, Rich Maw, Clive Pearson, Heather Phillips, Subash Sharma and Neil Swannick (substitute for Eric Broadbent).

Officers present: Fiona Casson (Legal Services Manager), Levi Korner (Systems Analyst), James Edward Mowbray (Democratic Services Officer), Nick Read (Area Planning Manager).

Apologies: Councillor Eric Broadbent.

Copies of all documents considered are in the Minute Book

27 Apologies for Absence

Apologies noted (see above).

28 Minutes for the Meeting held on Thursday 13/07/2023

The minutes of the meeting held on Thursday 13 July 2023 were confirmed and signed as an accurate record.

29 Declarations of Interests

There were no declarations of interest.

Planning Applications

The Committee considered reports of the Assistant Director Planning – Community Development Services relating to applications for planning permission. During the meeting, Officers referred to additional information and representations which had been received.

Except where an alternative condition was contained in the report or an amendment made by the Committee, the conditions as set out in the report and the appropriate time limit conditions were to be attached in accordance with the relevant provisions of Section 91 and 92 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

In considering the report(s) of the Assistant Director Planning – Community Development Services, regard had been paid to the policies of the relevant development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and all other material planning considerations. Where the Committee deferred consideration or refused planning permission the reasons for that decision are as shown in the report or as set out below.

Where the Committee granted planning permission in accordance with the recommendation in a

report this was because the proposal is in accordance with the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework or other material considerations as set out in the report unless otherwise specified below. Where the Committee granted planning permission contrary to the recommendation in the report the reasons for doing so and the conditions to be attached are set out below.

30 23/00183/FL 1-4 Farm Close, Gristhorpe - the demolition of a rear stone wall and the erection of a replacement wall in a new position and the reconfiguration of a parking area to introduce four electric vehicle charging points for Shaun Wood.

The Assistant Director Planning – Community Development Services sought the determination of a planning application for the demolition of a rear stone wall and the erection of a replacement wall in a new position and the reconfiguration of a parking area to introduce four electric vehicle charging points at 1-4 Farm Close, Gristhorpe on behalf of Shaun Wood.

Concluding his presentation the Planning Officer stressed that the condition on the original planning permission requiring that the original wall be repaired and retained was something that Members had sought, rather than being something that was recommended in advance by officers.

Sean McGrath, spoke on behalf of the applicant, in support of the application,

Roberta Swiers, division councillor, spoke in support of the application.

During consideration of the above application, the Committee discussed the following issues:-

- The speed with which the wall had deteriorated in recent years and the lack of care taken in ensuring the maintenance of the wall.
- The integrity of the Gristhorpe conservation area and the walls position within it.

The Decision:-

That the officer recommendation to refuse planning permission NOT BE SUPPORTED.

Voting Record:

A vote was taken and the motion was declared carried with four for and two against.

Reason:-

The Committee's reasons for refusing the officer's recommendation are set out below:-

- (i) Members did not feel that the application would be detrimental to the conservation area, or the ecology of the area, taking into account that this is a new build development.

Following the rejection of the officer's recommendation the Committee again considered the application discussing the following issues:-

- The need to landscape the front area of the four cottages.
- The need to provide some soft landscaping to the rear wall, as originally intended.

As Members had rejected the recommendation the officer went on to suggest potential conditions covering the follow:-

- Samples of the stone.

- A stone panel showing how the stone is to be put together, including details relating to pointing.
- Details of the gates.
- Anything that remains relevant from original approval.
- An overall landscaping scheme for the new layout.
- Surfacing details, regarding the new parking spaces and also the new footpaths.

Members went on to add to the above:

- Markers identifying the line of the original boundary wall.
- Use of a traditional lime mortar to point the wall.
- That officers be granted delegated authority to impose the conditions suggested previously by the officer and those requested by the Committee.

Decision:-

That contrary to officer recommendation planning permission be granted.

Voting Record:-

A vote was taken and the motion was declared carried unanimously.

Reason:-

Members felt that the application would not be detrimental to the conservation area, or the ecology of the area, taking into account that this is a new build development.

31 23/00182/HS 1-4 Farm Close, Gristhorpe - the construction of one dormer window to each rear elevation for Shaun Wood

The Assistant Director Planning – Community Development Services sought the determination of a planning application for the construction of one dormer window to each rear elevation at 1-4 Farm Close, Gristhorpe on behalf of Shaun Wood.

Updating the report the officer confirmed to Members that the Highways Authority had indicated that they had no objections to the proposal. Adding to his comments the officer sought delegated authority to add a further reason for refusal – that being the harm caused to the character and appearance of the buildings and also this part of the Gristhorpe conservation area as a result of large areas of glazing on the pantiles of the single story element. The officer went on to refer to paragraph 3.5(a) of the report and highlighted the refusal of a previous scheme for roof lights in the main roof of the building that would have detracted from the buildings aesthetic in a similar way to the glazing being proposed now.

Sean McGrath, spoke on behalf of the applicant, in support of the application,

Roberta Swiers, division councillor, spoke in support of the application.

Following the public speaking segment the officer took the unusual step of directly responding to some of the comments made by the agent.

- Reminded the Committee of their legal duty to ensure the preservation of, and enhance, the conservation area.
- That the recommendation of refusal wasn't necessarily an objection in principle to dormer windows in the roofspace in question. Adding that dormer windows are to an extent characteristic of Gristhorpe but that in those instances were traditional and far smaller than those being proposed in this instance.

During consideration of the above application, the Committee discussed the following issues:-

- The size of the proposed windows.

The Decision:-

That permission be refused for the reasons cited in the report as well as the additional reason for refusal outlined by the officer in his opening remarks.

Voting Record:-

A vote was taken and the motion was declared carried with four for and three against.

Reason:-

For the reasons outlined in the report and as amended by the officers at the meeting.

32 Any other items

There were no urgent items of business.

33 Date of Next Meeting

10.00 Thursday 14 September 2023 Scarborough Town Hall.

The meeting concluded at 15:20.